The Effectiveness of Repeated Reading and Supported Cloze Procedure to Improve Beginning Reading Skills in Elementary School Slow Learner Students

Rahma Elok Sofianti¹, Fitri Andriani²

¹²Department of Psychology, University Airlangga, Indonesia

Email: ¹ rahmaelokssofianti11@gmail.com, ² fitri.andriani@psikologi.unair.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Literacy plays a very important role in the academic performance and overall development of elementary school students. However, many elementary school age children experience problems in reading, including fluency, accuracy, and reading comprehension. This affects the learning process and causes poor academic results. The initial reading ability of 4th grade elementary school slow learner students at MI Salafiyah Mahbubiyah still has not received special treatment to improve their reading ability. Improving initial reading skills in slow learner students must be done in the right way, one of which is repeated reading and supported cloze procedures. To overcome this problem, the intervention was carried out using the repeated reading method and supported cloze procedure. The aim of this research is to see the effectiveness of repeated reading and supported cloze procedures to improve the beginning reading abilities of slow learner students in grade 4 of elementary school. This intervention aims to improve early reading skills in elementary school children who experience slow learning. This research uses a single case experimental design, where the subjects are 4th grade elementary school students. The development of the subject's reading ability was measured using Gickling and Armstrong's checklist, namely Reading Proficiency and Error Checklists. The results of the research show that there is a difference after being given the repeated reading and supported cloze procedure technique and before being given the repeated reading and supported cloze procedure on the subject. This means that (Ha) is accepted and (Ho) is rejected. So, it can be concluded that the repeated reading and supported cloze procedure is effective in improving the initial reading skills of slow learner students in grade 4 of elementary school.

KEYWORDS:
Repeated Reading; Supported Cloze Procedure; Reading Skills

ABSTRAK

Literasi memainkan peran yang sangat penting dalam kinerja akademik dan perkembangan keseluruhan siswa sekolah dasar. Namun banyak anak usia sekolah dasar yang mengalami permasalahan dalam membaca, meliputi kelancaran, ketepatan, dan pemahaman bacaan. Hal ini berpengaruh dalam proses pembelajaran dan menyebabkan hasil akademik yang buruk. Kemampuan membaca permulaan pada siswa slow learner kelas 4 SD di MI Salafiyah Mahbubiyah masih belum mendapatkan penanganan khusus untuk meningkatkan kemampuan membacanya. Meningkatkan kemampuan membaca permulaan pada siswa slow learner harus dilakukan dengan cara yang tepat, salah satunya dengan repeated reading dan supported cloze procedure. Untuk mengatasi masalah ini, intervensi dilakukan dengan menggunakan metode repeated reading dan supported cloze procedure. Tujuan penelitian ini adalah untuk melihat efektivitas repeated reading dan supported cloze procedure untuk meningkatkan kemampuan membaca permulaan siswa slow learner kelas 4 SD. Intervensi tersebut bertujuan untuk meningkatkan kemampuan membaca di antara anak sekolah dasar yang mengalami slow learning. Penelitian ini menggunakan desain eksperimen kasus tunggal, dimana subjeknya adalah siswa kelas 4 SD. Perkembangan kemampuan membaca subjek diukur dengan checklist milik Gickling dan Armstrong yaitu Reading Proficiency dan Error Checklists. Hasil dari penelitian menunjukkan bahwa ada perbedaan setelah diberikan Teknik membaca repeated reading dan supported cloze procedure dan sebelum diberikan repeated reading dan supported cloze procedure pada subjek Artyna, (Ha) diterima dan (Ho) ditolak. Maka, dapat disimpulkan bahwa repeated reading and supported cloze procedure efektif untuk meningkatkan kemampuan membaca permulaan pada siswa slow learner kelas 4 Sekolah Dasar.

Copyright (c) 2024 Rahma Elok Sofianti & Fitri Andriani

Korespondensi:

Rahma Elok Sofianti
Department of Psychology, University Airlangga, Indonesia
Email: rahmaelokssofianti11@gmail.com
BACKGROUND

Students are said to be successful in learning in participating in teaching and learning activities determined by their mastery of reading skills. If students are not able to read well and correctly, they will have difficulty participating in teaching and learning activities in class. Because with good reading mastery, students will be able to capture and understand the information conveyed from various textbooks. So, the learning process will be slower than students who do not have problems in reading. Reading is a skill that students must master in order to fully understand school lessons. However, not all students can acquire these skills quickly. Apart from that, students experience slow learning and have limitations in intellectual abilities, memory and concentration (Claranita & Suprapti, 2022).

There are facts stated in Kompasiana (2015) which state that the reading level of Indonesian elementary school children is still relatively low compared to other countries. It turns out that Indonesian children’s reading ability is ranked 42nd out of 45 participating countries. This is based on the results of the Progress in International Reading Literacy Study (PIRLS) research in 2014. Three categories are used to determine the severity of reading disability, viz. light, medium, and heavy. Easy category if the perceived difficulty is only in one or two domains. Meanwhile, when the perceived difficulty involves one or two areas, the person can overcome it on their own, without help. Meanwhile, the serious level is when someone cannot control it and needs help (Rahma et al., 2023).

There are two stages of reading activities in elementary school, namely beginning reading, which is given in the first years of elementary school (grades 1, 2 and 3) and reading for comprehension or advanced reading, which is given and must be mastered by children in upper class (grades 4, 5, and 6). So, beginning reading is a learning process for elementary school students who are in the early grades. At this stage, students learn to gain the ability to master reading techniques and capture reading content (Ministry of National Education, 2006).

Chall introduced a scheme of reading stages according to Piaget’s pattern of cognitive development. This stage includes the prereading stage, the decoding stage, the stage of confirmation, fluency and reading printed writing, the reading to learn stage. for-learning stage), the multiple viewpoints period, and the ‘world view stage’. The focus of this scheme is about what happens to the reader and the environment to support the reader to become more mature in the stages of reading development. Several hypotheses underlying his thinking regarding reading development, namely (Chall, 2013) yaitu : pertama, Pre-reading stage (Preschool to Kindergarten, ages 0-6 years). Kedua, Stage One: Initial reading or coding stage (Grades 1-2 elementary school, ages 6-7 years). Ketiga, Stage Two: Confirmation, fluency, regardless of print (Grades 2-3 elementary school, ages 7-8 years), Keempat, Stage Three: Reading to learn new things from one point of view (Grades 4-6 elementary school, ages 9-12 years). Kelima, Stage Four: Multiple points of view (High school, ages 15-18). Keenam, Stage Five: Worldview (College, ages 18+).

Betts (1946 in Treptow et al., 2007) assumed that students who are given assignments with a sufficient level of familiarity but still challenging will get the most optimal learning experience. These quite challenging tasks are then known as tasks that are at the level of student instruction. Tasks that provide too little challenge are called the independent level, while tasks that provide too little challenge are called the frustration level. Students reach the independent level when they know >97% of the words contained in a narrative, are at the instruction level when they know 93-97% of the words contained in a narrative and are at the frustration level when they know it higher than other individuals. at the level of frustration (Treptow et al., 2007).

Factors that influence students’ low reading ability are intelligence level, language skills, attitudes and interests, reading conditions, reading habits, knowledge of how to read, social, economic and cultural background and emotions. Students who experience slow learning or what is usually called a slow learner are individuals whose intellectual capacity is below normal, but are not mentally disabled. Slow learner students usually have an IQ score between 70-89. Individuals who are slow learners can be identified by a lack of sensitivity to the environment, lack of enthusiasm in the learning process, lack of focus in completing things, and slow thinking. These individuals are better than mentally retarded but also slower than normal students. Students who are slow learners in class will need more time to study than their other friends. Even though their intelligence is below average and they are not capable children, they need to struggle hard to master what they learn in regular classes.

There have been various research-based interventions developed to address barriers to fluency in reading aloud. Two approaches that are generally used in fluency interventions in reading aloud are repeated reading (RR) and supported cloze procedure (SCP). According to Samuel (1979) RR consists of continuously rereading a narrative until it reaches the desired level of fluency. Students who received the RR intervention engaged in a lot of practice with the goal of increasing the amount and accuracy of their reading. RR can be done with or without audio support. If done with audio support, students will be asked to read silently while listening to a recording of the text they are reading. After several times this process, the child is asked to read aloud without any assistance from audio recordings (S. Jay Samuels, 1979). Therrien (2004 in (Parker & Burns, 2014) found that this method was effective for students with learning difficulties as well as normal students.

In general, RR involves a student reading aloud several times to a teacher or peer tutor. During or after reading aloud, the teacher or peer tutor will provide feedback and record the number of words read correctly during one minute. One of the goals of RR is for students to achieve predetermined CWPM targets. RR is often accompanied by a method for monitoring progress and providing feedback on
performance as a step to encourage students to improve their performance (Education et al., 2018). In RR, correcting mistakes is often made by adults or peers to correct misread words during the rereading process. This is done by asking students to repeat the correct words and read the words in complete sentences. This can be done while reading or after finishing reading. Having corrections in reading helps students to improve accuracy in the next reading opportunity (Education et al., 2018).

SCP is an assisted intervention in which an instructor reads a narrative together with the student. There are several variations on SCP, but a common approach involves the student and instructor reading each word in the narrative, then starting to take turns reading word by word so that each word is imitated and reread by the student. The SCP intervention specifically targets reading accuracy by modeling the correct way to read words. Interventions using SCP are also effective in improving abilities such as fluency and understanding (Parker & Burns, 2014).

Another term used to refer to SCP is listening while reading (LWR). The difference between RR and LWR is that in LWR, students read together with readers who are fluent in the same text. In LWR, students are allowed to read aloud or read silently while more fluent readers read (Hawkins, Marsicano, Schmitt, McCallum, & Rao, 2015). Schreiber (1980 in Rasinski 1990) stated that the presence of readers who are fluent in RR will increase the effectiveness of RR when compared with interventions that only implement RR. LWR is a versatile instructional approach because it can be used in groups or individually (Rasinski, 1990).

Although SCP or LWR and RR are effective in facilitating reading fluency and comprehension, these two types of intervention target the hierarchy of instruction at different levels. Interventions that focus on accuracy (SCP/LWR), target the acquisition level, while interventions that focus on accurate response speed (RR) target the proficiency level.

Based on the instructional hierarchy, interventions that focus on speed may not be very effective when students are at the learning level of task accuracy, because students do not yet have the skills to read words accurately. Therefore, it may be more appropriate to determine interventions by considering students’ reading accuracy (Parker & Burns, 2014).

Apart from that, there are also several studies that use a combination of several interventions to address the problem of fluency in reading aloud (Eckert et al., 2002; Guzel-Ozmen, 2011). One study found that combining interventions on consequences and antecedents in reading aloud fluency would result in higher increases in reading aloud fluency than using only interventions on antecedents (Eckert et al., 2002). Previous research found that there was a significant increase as a function of a combination of interventions using repeated reading, listening passage preview and performance feedback (Guzel-Ozmen, 2011).

Performance feedback is defined as providing information regarding student reading behavior. Performance feedback is carried out by informing students how much time was needed and the mistakes made during the reading process. If repeated reading is combined with performance feedback, then before students start reading the text on the next occasion, the assistant will encourage students to reduce the time needed to read and the number of errors. Several other studies synthesized through the research of Chard et al (2002) also found that children with learning difficulties would benefit from interventions consisting of several components. Apart from that, it was also found that several functions of the intervention, such as combining repeated reading with corrective feedback, supported increasing fluency in reading aloud by reducing errors made by readers (Chard et al., 2002).

Research conducted by Meyer & Felton (1999) found that the repeated reading method will have a transfer effect on other texts, even though the text is not a text that is read repeatedly. Rashotte and Torgesen (1985, in Meyer & Felton, 1999) and Dowhower (1987 in Meyer & Felton, 1999) suspect that what causes the transfer effect in repeated reading is the same number of words between texts. In addition, the repeated reading condition also influences the transfer effect. Repeated reading with assistance is a condition that can produce increased accuracy in identifying words in texts that are not read repeatedly (Meyer & Felton, 1999).

Apart from that, the use of the repeated reading method can also improve reading skills in grade 3 elementary school students. The ages of grade 3 and grade 4 of elementary school are at the same reading stage, namely stage 3, namely reading to learn new things (Hidayat, 2018). In line with existing problems and factors that hinder reading ability, it is stated that the intelligence factor influences students' reading ability. So the researcher wants to conduct research on repeated reading and is supported by the cloze procedure to improve initial reading skills in slow learner students. With the aim that students who are slow learners who experience their initial reading abilities at the frustration stage can improve their initial reading abilities at the elementary school level.

RESEARCH METHODS

Types of Research

The research method used is an experimental research method with a single case experimental design or what is usually called a single case. This research design uses a small number of subjects to test the effectiveness of an intervention and uses repeated measurements to test the implementation of the intervention, specific data analysis, and statistics (Krasny-Pacini & Evans, 2018). Manolov’s research was conducted using a single case experimental design, which involved setting clear goals for the subjects, monitoring problem behavior, establishing the intervention and its effectiveness, and stages of implementation (Manolov et al., 2014).

Research Subject

The population in the study were students who had difficulty learning to read at the beginning due to slow learning. The subjects of this research were 10-year-old grade students at...
4 elementary school students with low initial reading abilities caused by being slow learners. The assessment was carried out using the reading ability checklist and reading errors by Gickling & Armstrong (1978) and DSM V specific learning with impairment in reading. From the reading ability checklist and reading errors by Gickling & Armstrong (1978), the results showed that the subject's initial reading ability was at the frustration stage. Apart from that, from the results of DSM V specific learning with impairment in reading, the subject met the 9 criteria provided.

Data Collection

The Intelligence Test (WISC) is also used to determine the subject’s intellectual strengths and weaknesses. Apart from that, to see the potential for verbal abilities and performance abilities. The data used is psychological research in the form of interviews with parents and teachers with the aim of obtaining an overview of the subject regarding their developmental history, how they deal with reading problems and factors that might cause the subject’s poor reading ability. Observations were carried out to identify information regarding reading errors made by subjects during learning at school.

Data Analysis Technique

Experimental data analysis was carried out individually. In contrast to experimental group designs that compare one group with another, individual experimental studies provide data belonging to control subjects for the purpose of within-subject comparisons rather than between-subject designs. This research includes a comparison between two experimental periods (Justin I. Odegaard & Chawla, 2008). The data analysis used in the research is the visual inspection method (Novinta & Mastuti, 2023). The first step is to establish individual standards of behavior. This can be compared with the next state and can indicate certain qualities. Post-intervention data is used to determine whether there are changes in behavior that occur after implementing the intervention (Seftiani et al., 2023).

This research required eleven sessions to obtain maximum experimental results. The goals or behavioral targets expected by using a combination of 2 treatments (RR and SCP), namely:

Table 1. Implementation Procedures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>Able to read letters in their entirety and multiple vowels up to instructional level</td>
<td>Repeated reading and Supported Cloze Procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 &amp; 4</td>
<td>Able to read all diphthong-vowel and syllable combinations up to instructional level</td>
<td>Repeated reading and Supported Cloze Procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 &amp; 6</td>
<td>Able to read words with a consonant vowel</td>
<td>Repeated reading and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Research Result After Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alphabet Letters</th>
<th>Multiple Vocal</th>
<th>Diphthong-vowel</th>
<th>Syllable combinations</th>
<th>Vowel-Consonant</th>
<th>Paragraph Reading Equivalent to Grade 1 Elementary School</th>
<th>Paragraph Reading Equivalent to Grade 2 Elementary School</th>
<th>Paragraph Reading Equivalent to Grade 3 Elementary School</th>
<th>Paragraph Reading Equivalent to Grade 4 Elementary School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Instructional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Frustration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Frustration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Frustration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Frustration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuration</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Instructional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Research Result After Intervention

After giving treatment using both methods, namely repeated reading and supported cloze procedure, the results showed better than before the treatment was given.

The ability to read letters is carried out in the first session with the aim that the client can read the letters well and correctly. During the informal test the result was 90.4%
and after being given the intervention it increased by 9.6% and got a perfect score of 100%. This means showing that the client’s ability to read letters is at an independent level. Then in session 2 which was held on the same day, reading double vowels, which was previously at a frustration level of 8.4%, after being given intervention rose to 83%. Even though it is still at the frustrating level, the ability to read double vowels has increased quite significantly.

Sessions 3 and 4 are to improve the ability to read vowel diphthongs and syllables. The initial ability to read diphthongs before being given the intervention was 0% and increased by 83% after being given the intervention. Meanwhile, his ability to read syllables, which was initially 83%, increased to 100% and was at independent level.

The 3rd meeting was held in session 5 and session 6 which had the aim that the client could read consonant vowels and read consonant vowels. The client’s ability to read vowel consonants before intervention was 33.4%. After being given intervention, it remained at the frustration level but increased by 49.6%, namely to 83%. Then, continued with session 6, namely reading consonant vowel consonants with initial results of 66.7% and increasing to 83% after intervention was given. The 7th session was carried out to improve the ability to read a paragraph in a class 1 textbook. Before the intervention was carried out, it was known that the ability to read a class 1 textbook was still at a frustrating level, namely 83%. After being given the intervention, it increased by 10% to 93% in the ability to read grade 1 texts.

The 5th meeting was held in session 8 to improve the ability to read 2nd grade elementary school reading paragraphs. The client’s reading ability has increased so that it is at the instructional level (94%) which was initially at the frustration level (73%). Then, on the following day, session 9 was held, namely, to improve the ability to read paragraphs for grade 3 elementary school reading and there was an increase of 17%. What was originally 70% became 87%.

The last meeting was held in session 10, namely improving the ability to read texts in grade 4 elementary school with results of 86%. This ability increased by 26%, with initial results before intervention being given, namely 60%. Then, it continues with session 11, namely termination. Here, the author says that the intervention has ended. Based on the results of the intervention provided, it shows that repeated reading and supported cloze procedures can improve the beginning reading abilities of slow learner students in grade 4 elementary school.

**DISCUSSION**

The ability to read fluently has many benefits for elementary school students. Research study by Hintze et al., (2002) fluent readers contributed 42% to reading comprehension. Over the last few decades there has been much discussion about interventions that can be used to improve reading comprehension. For example, the Repeated Reading Method can help increase reading speed per minute, reduce word recognition errors, and improve prosodic skills while reading. These benefits ultimately help improve understanding when reading (Ja'afar, 2016).

Another method that is often used to improve reading fluency for elementary school students is a combined intervention, namely repeated reading, listening while reading, error correction and performance feedback. In research conducted by Kuswardani et al., (2023) it shows that if the four combined interventions are carried out effectively, they will be able to increase the reading ability and fluency of elementary school students. Apart from that, positive family support increases learning motivation (Putri, 2023).

It is not only the combination of these four that can improve students’ reading abilities. However, if the four combined interventions are given separately, they can also have a good impact on improving students’ reading abilities. As in research by Friedland et al., (2017) repeated reading and listening while reading can help to improve reading comprehension. Good feedback given to students after reading is error correction. But in reality, to get effective results you have to think about how many corrections to make and at what point they need to be made correct. To correct students’ mistakes without weakening them motivation (Amara, 2015). Lastly, performance feedback provides positive benefits that are applied immediately after the learning process, performance feedback can even be given to those who experience learning disabilities (Hornery et al., 2014).

**CONCLUSION**

Based on the results of research at MI Salafiyah Mahobiyah Plumpang, researchers have presented the data in the previous chapter with the conclusion that repeated reading and supported cloze procedures are effective in improving initial reading skills in slow learner students. Repeated reading and supported cloze procedures provided improvements ranging from 9.6% to 83%. Suggestions for teachers, it is better to give an assessment for each grade increase to find out the characteristics of students so that they can find out earlier about student problems. So that treatment can be given earlier. Meanwhile, suggestions for future researchers are to be able to find other problems from students and find the right treatment according to the student’s situation.

**REFERENCE**


Education, S., Children, T., February, N., Lo, Y., Cooke, N. L., Starling, A. L. P.,


Annals of Physical and Rehabilitation Medicine


https://doi.org/10.1007/s11881-999-0027-8