

ANALYZING THE PERCEPTION OF THE BLIND AND VISUALLY- IMPAIRED ON THE USE OF AUDIO DESCRIPTION: A CASE STUDY

Patricia Nanda Setiawan¹, Suwarni Wijaya Halim^{2*}

¹English Study Program, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Bunda Mulia
University, Indonesia

²Doctoral in Applied English Linguistics, Faculty of Education and Languages, Atma Jaya
Catholic University of Indonesia, Indonesia

*Pos-el: suwarni.halim@gmail.com

ABSTRAK

Orang-orang dengan disabilitas, termasuk tunanetra dan penyandang gangguan penglihatan, memerlukan beberapa bentuk aksesibilitas untuk membantu mereka melakukan berbagai aktivitas dalam kehidupan sehari-hari. Salah satu bentuk bantuan yang dirancang untuk membantu tunanetra dan penyandang gangguan penglihatan adalah audio description. Audio description merupakan bentuk terjemahan audiovisual yang dapat bermanfaat bagi tunanetra dan penyandang gangguan penglihatan dalam mengakses karya audiovisual. Namun, audio description belum diterapkan secara luas di Indonesia. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menyelidiki persepsi mahasiswa tunanetra dan penyandang gangguan penglihatan di Mardi Wuto English Club terhadap penggunaan audio description. Para peneliti mewawancarai delapan mahasiswa tunanetra dan penyandang gangguan penglihatan di Mardi Wuto English Club setelah mereka menonton film pendek tanpa dan dengan audio description di Youtube berjudul "The Rose" yang diproduksi oleh CHILDLINE India. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa para partisipan memiliki persepsi positif terhadap audio description karena mereka merasa terbantu dalam memahami adegan-adegan tanpa dialog dan alur cerita dalam film pendek tersebut.

Kata kunci: *audio description, penerjemahan audiovisual, tunanetra dan penyandang gangguan penglihatan*

ABSTRACT

Disabled people, including the blind and visually impaired, need some accessibility to help them do some activities in their lives. One of the assistance designed to help the blind and visually impaired is audio description. Audio description is a form of audiovisual translation that can be beneficial for the blind and visually impaired in accessing audiovisual works. However, audio description has not been applied widely in Indonesia. This research aims to investigate the perceptions of blind and visually impaired students in the Mardi Wuto English Club regarding the use of audio description. The researchers interviewed eight blind and visually impaired students in Mardi Wuto English Club after they watched a short film without and with audio description on YouTube entitled "The Rose" produced by CHILDLINE India.

The results indicated that the participants had a positive perception of the audio description, as they found it helpful to comprehend the silent scenes and storyline in that short film.

Keywords: audio description, audiovisual translation, blind and visually impaired

A. INTRODUCTION

The use of audio description (AD) has been on the rise recently (Jankowska, 2019). Audio description is a form of narration used to provide information about surrounding key visual elements in an audiovisual work for the benefit of blind and visually impaired consumers. As reported by Lopez et al. (2018), audio description technology has improved significantly and is now being offered to blind audiences as a tool for watching movies at various cinemas in many developed countries. Moreover, in Australia, television programs also include audio descriptions for blind viewers. Many movie streaming sites, such as Netflix and YouTube for the Blind, have also begun to utilize it. However, the use of AD is not yet common in Indonesia (Karolina et al., 2019).

Rif'Ati et al. (2021) reported that approximately 8 million Indonesian people experienced problems in their vision, ranging from total blindness to impaired vision. With such a significant number, some forms of assistance have been created to help them navigate their daily activities and enjoy a good quality of life. Books with braille alphabets, guiding blocks on the sidewalk, and a 5-millimeter difference in size on the 2022 edition Rupiah banknote are some examples of assistance for the blind and visually impaired in Indonesia. Despite the assistance, the blind and visually impaired in Indonesia still experience much inconvenience when going through their lives; one such inconvenience is in terms of consuming foreign audiovisual materials such as foreign films, videos, and so on. A lot of audiovisual materials accessible in Indonesia do not provide AD; thus, many blind and visually impaired Indonesians are unaware and unfamiliar with the existence of AD.

This gap presents an opportunity for the researchers to explore the topic of AD in the Indonesian context. After perusing the existing literature, the researchers found several studies that exclusively focus on the use of AD. For example, Ferziger et al. (2020) conducted research to investigate the influence of AD on the quality of the theater experience and the satisfaction of blind or visually impaired people during the implementation of AD services in Israeli theaters. Another study was conducted by Lopez et al. (2018) to examine the findings of a survey and focus group discussions in which visually impaired people in the UK discussed the positive and negative aspects of AD. In addition, Zengin Temirbek uulu et al. (2021) compared how well the visually impaired and sighted participants in Turkey understood two different versions of the same movie—one with and one without audio description—to see how much to which AD aids visually impaired people in understanding a movie. None of the studies, however, focused on the use of AD in Indonesia, specifically on the perceptions of the blind and visually impaired Indonesians on the use of AD in foreign audiovisual materials. Therefore, the researchers decided to explore the topic further to enrich the current literature.

This research attempted to answer the following research question: *How do the blind and visually impaired perceive audio description?* To acquire the data on the perception of the blind and visually impaired, the researchers interviewed eight blind and visually impaired Indonesians. All of them were members of *Mardi Wuto* English Club (MVEC), a social agency in Indonesia that provides an English Club for blind and visually impaired students.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Audio Description (AD) for the blind and visually impaired

Audiovisual materials such as films, YouTube videos, and so on are created by combining the audio and visual aspects. Both aspects are crucial and greatly contribute to the consumers' comprehension of the audiovisual content. However, in the case of people who are impaired in one aspect, they cannot fully access the audiovisual materials. This situation needs to be remedied through the provision of facilities that could provide equivalent access to people with disabilities (Udo & Fels, 2010). For example, to help deaf and hearing-impaired people consume audiovisual materials, subtitles are provided (Taufik, 2017), either by professional translators, by machine translation using automated speech recognition (Taufik & Tan, 2018), or by the use of other technology such as artificial intelligence (Engliana & da Silva, 2025). In the case of the blind and visually impaired, one such facility is audio description (AD), which is especially devised for the blind and visually impaired for the purpose of consumption of audiovisual materials.

Perego (2019, p. 333) explained that AD is “the acoustic verbal description of the visual elements of any cultural (static and dynamic) product for the benefit of people with visual impairment.” In the same spirit, Benecke (2007) mentioned that AD is a supplementary narrative that describes important elements such as the action, body language, facial expressions, scenery, and costumes in order to make theater and any audiovisual works like movies and TV shows accessible to blind and visually impaired people. In other words, AD could be viewed as an assistive feature to aid the blind and visually impaired audiences in understanding the presented material and in enhancing comprehension (Hyks, 2005; Benecke, 2007; Taufik, 2022). The description arises naturally between the dialogues and avoids interfering with any crucial sound or musical effects. In short, AD only appears when there is no dialogue in a scene, yet there is something important to be known by the blind audience. For example, transitions of scenes, certain actions done in silence, unfamiliar sounds, and indistinct noises that cannot be understood and comprehended by hearing are described through AD.

Díaz-Cintas (2008, p. 7) highlighted that “audio description consists of transforming visual images into words, which are then spoken during the silent intervals of audiovisual programs or live performances.” This definition highlights that AD contains two different types of signs to be converted, which are visual signs and verbal signs. According to this perspective, AD can be categorized as a type of intersemiotic translation that occurs in reverse to the one proposed by Jakobson (1959), namely, transforming images and nonverbal signs into verbal signs. In the case of films, it implies that the visual images, as well as any important details to the plot, are translated into AD. In addition, the translation in AD is done in the same language as the source works.

AD thus can be classified under audiovisual translation. Chiaro (2012, pp. 4-5) stated that “audiovisuals are made to be both heard (audio) and seen (visual) simultaneously, and the verbal and visual contents of audiovisual products function inseparably to create a meaningful whole.” Because the consumers are visually impaired, they are more likely to miss auditory and/or visual information while encountering audiovisual content, which is why specific access services like AD must be provided for them.

During the process of creating AD, words that make up the target text are generated through the source text's components. In the case of films, the process entails converting visual and, to a lesser extent, auditory cues into spoken description. The original film serves as both the source and the target text in this instance, along with the audio description. Films, according to Chiaro (2012), are made up of several codes that are combined to form a single impact, and they are comprised of a sequence of linguistic signals that will be received both acoustically and visually. In this semiotic system, acoustic elements include verbal signs, such as dialogue and song lyrics, while visual elements are in the form of written information that appears on screen, such as opening credits, closing credits, and text messages among the actors. In addition, nonverbal signs can be included both in acoustic elements (such as sound effects, music, background noises such as breathing, hiccups, laughter, crying, and so on) and in visual elements (such as the actors' facial expressions, gestures, movements, hairstyles, costumes, and so on). In a nutshell, AD must overcome the issue of reproducing the sensation of seeing a movie for the blind while maintaining the same experience between sighted and blind people (Chao, 2002; Remael et al., 2015). Figure 1 below illustrates a scene from the short film entitled *The Rose – A Child Abuse Short Film* (2013) produced by CHILDLINE 1098.



Figure 1: A Scene from *The Rose – A Child Abuse Short Film* (2013)

Figure 1 above depicts a silent scene. In the scene, the boy named Mani showed his sad expression, and there was no dialogue or narration. When blind and visually impaired audiences experience that scene, they will most likely think that nothing happened during the scene, while in fact, Mani's expressions greatly contribute to the audiences' understanding of the film's plot and Mani's character development. Therefore, in the 2015 version, AD is added into the scene: "In the classroom, Mani is sad and crying," so that the blind and visually impaired audiences would understand that the boy named Mani shows a sad expression during the scene.

1. Previous studies

As previously noted in the Introduction section, several experts have conducted studies on the application of AD. One of them is Ferziger et al. (2020). This study investigated the impact of AD on the quality of the theater experience and the satisfaction of blind or visually impaired individuals during the implementation of AD service in Israeli theaters. To measure satisfaction,

experience quality, and accessibility-related factors, quantitative questionnaires were developed. Each participant watched two separate plays—one with audio description and the other without. A comparison of the quality of the experience with and without AD showed that the play with the AD provided a considerably better experience, with 87% of the participants reporting high overall satisfaction from the AD narration service. This study then suggested that AD is a vital service that should be extensively used to increase blind and visually impaired individuals' participation in cultural activities. Additionally, AD should be made available in addition to proper accessibility considerations.

Similarly, Lopez et al. (2018) conducted a study analyzing the results of a survey and focus groups in which visually impaired participants discussed the advantages and disadvantages of AD. The result of this discussion is that 52% of the participants indicated that they wished AD were more widely available. This survey provided the research team with a better grasp of the present level of accessibility and highlighted the wide range of preferences among visually impaired AD users, emphasizing the need to accept diversity within accessible services through personalization. Therefore, Lopez et al. (2018) suggested that focusing on gathering opinions on what could be changed in terms of accessibility to film and television might allow other researchers to explore a variety of possibilities for how the research could develop based on the users' preferences.

Another similar study was conducted by Zengin Temirbek uulu et al. (2021). This research examined how well visually impaired and sighted participants understood two different versions of the same movie—one with and one without audio description—in order to determine the extent to which AD aids in visually impaired people's comprehension of a film. The qualitative analysis validated this finding and demonstrated that the visually impaired participants were able to comprehend the film to a great extent with the assistance of audio description. These results highlighted the value of AD as a tool for turning visual information into vocal information, which considerably facilitates the interpretation of films by those who are blind or visually impaired.

In Indonesia, the use of AD is not common. As a result, studies on AD in Indonesia context are scarce. Many films screened in Indonesia do not have AD facilities for the blind and visually impaired (Karolina et al., 2019). Without any innovative accessibility features for those with disabilities, especially those with visual impairments, Indonesian cinemas currently can only entertain normal people. As a result, to consume foreign films, many of the blind and visually impaired still have to bring a friend as a visual reader to the cinema to help depict a scene in the film through whispers. As a response to the limited accessibility for the blind and visually impaired in consuming audiovisual materials, it is hoped that the exploration of AD in the Indonesian context would provide valuable insights for the Indonesian film and audiovisual industries.

C. METHOD

This research is qualitative in nature and utilized a case study design. Kumar (2019, p. 127) mentioned that qualitative research is “a very useful design when exploring an area where little is known or where you want to have a holistic understanding of the situation, phenomenon, episode, site, group or community.” In this case, the researchers aimed to investigate the perceptions of the blind and visually impaired on the use of AD, which is rarely found and employed in the Indonesian audiovisual landscape. Therefore, the qualitative research was deemed appropriate for this study. Meanwhile, Crowe et al. (2011, p. 1) stated that case study “is particularly useful to employ when there is a need to obtain an in-depth appreciation of an

issue, event or phenomenon of interest, in its natural real-life context.” The case study design was chosen as it was deemed compatible with the purpose of this research, which is to analyze a group’s experience of a little-known topic, namely AD. Since AD can be considered a new form of accessibility for the blind and visually impaired in Indonesia, a case study is the suitable research design to explore the experience of the participants about the use of AD.

The source of data in this research is eight students in the *Mardi Wuto* English Club (MWEC). MWEC was chosen to be the object of this research because MWEC is a social agency that provides an English Club for blind and visually impaired students. Table 1 specifies the demographic information of the participants. Before the process of data collection began, the researchers explained the purpose of the research, the details and mechanism of the data collection, and how the data would be analyzed and used in the research. The researchers also emphasized that the participants’ identities would be treated as confidential, and they were free to withdraw their participation at any time. The participants—due to their impaired vision—were not able to sign written consent. As a result, they verbally gave their consent to the researchers, and their participation in the research had been approved by the study program.

Table 1. Participants’ Demographic Information

No.	Pseudonym	Age	Degree of Visual Impairment	Category	Years of Visual Impairment	Perceived Level of English Proficiency
1	Vince	28	Blindness	Adventitious	13 years	Intermediate
2	Ary	26	Blindness	Adventitious	10 years	Advanced
3	Zoe	21	Blindness	Congenital	21 years	Advanced
4	Tifa	24	Blindness	Congenital	24 years	Advanced
5	Bora	20	Blindness	Congenital	20 years	Intermediate
6	Rick	39	Blindness	Congenital	39 years	Advanced
7	Kayla	32	Blindness	Adventitious	15 years	Intermediate
8	Hans	35	Blindness	Adventitious	20 years	Advanced

The participants would be instructed to watch a short film twice—first, without AD and finally, with AD. The short film is entitled *The Rose – A Child Abuse Short Film* (2013), along with its other version, *The Rose – A Child Abuse Short Film* (2015). Both films were produced by CHILDLINE 1098. The short film is an animation and tells about a student named Mani who was frequently punished by his teacher and constantly bullied by his classmates. His teacher often scolded him and applied corporal punishment on him. Such treatment made him feel sad and depressed, and he ended up projecting his frustration onto the rose that he planted. There are two versions of the film; one without AD, which was released in 2013, and the other with AD, which was released in 2015. This short film was selected for this study for two reasons. First is because the film provides AD for the viewers, and second is because it features an easy-to-understand pronunciation and simple vocabulary; both of which would greatly aid the research participants to comprehend the short film more easily.

To investigate the perception of the blind and visually impaired, a semi-structured interview was employed. The interview allows the researchers to obtain information from the visually-challenged participants through oral responses, and the semi-structured mode enables the researchers to probe deeper into the issue to scrutinize the participants’ thoughts and attitudes on the use of AD. The questions for the interview were adapted from the questionnaire items from Bardini (2017). This questionnaire was used as a reference for the interview questions because it shares a corresponding aim with this study, namely to get insights about

AD users' film comprehension and experiences. In the case of the present study, however, the questionnaire items were converted into oral interview questions to accommodate the research participants.

The interview for the study was conducted in the participants' native tongue, which is Indonesian. The interview itself was divided into two parts. The first part started with the participants watching the short film without AD and being interviewed afterwards. The questions that were asked were open-ended questions about some of the intrinsic elements of the short film, such as the plot, the setting, and the moral value of the short film. This part aimed to find out how many details of the short film the participants could grasp without AD. After the first part was completed, the second part commenced by having the respondents watch the short film with AD. The researchers started by explaining what AD is and repeated questions about the intrinsic elements to discover how much information the participants could get from the film with the feature of AD. In addition, the researchers asked some questions regarding the perceptions of the participants on the use of AD. The interview questions are listed below.

Part I (after watching the short film without AD)

- *Di mana latar tempat terjadinya film pendek tersebut?* (Where is the setting of the short film?)
- *Kapan terjadinya film pendek tersebut?* (When did the short film take place?)
- *Secara singkat, ceritakanlah kembali film pendek tersebut.* (Please briefly retell the short film.)
- *Apa pesan moral dalam film pendek ini?* (What is the moral message contained in this short film?)

Part II (after watching the short film with AD)

- *Sebelumnya, apakah Anda pernah mendengar tentang Audio Deskripsi?* (Have you ever heard of AD before?)
- *Di mana latar tempat terjadinya film pendek tersebut?* (Where is the setting of the short film?)
- *Kapan terjadinya film pendek tersebut?* (When did the short film take place?)
- *Secara singkat, ceritakanlah kembali film pendek tersebut.* (Please briefly retell the short film.)
- *Apa pesan moral dalam film pendek ini?* (What is the moral message contained in this short film?)
- *Dengan audio deskripsi yang tersedia, seberapa berguna audio deskripsi dalam membantu Anda mempunyai gambaran mengenai adegan apa yang terjadi ketika tidak ada dialog dalam film pendek ini?* (With the AD provided, how useful is the AD in helping you to have an idea of what happens when there is no dialogue in this short film?)
- *Dengan audio deskripsi yang tersedia, seberapa berguna audio deskripsi dalam membantu Anda memahami jalan cerita pada film pendek ini?* (With the AD provided, how useful is the AD in helping you understand the storyline of this short film?)
- *Apa yang Anda rasakan ketika menonton film tanpa audio deskripsi dan dengan audio deskripsi?* (What do you feel when you watch a movie without AD and with AD?)
- *Menurut Anda, seberapa berguna audio deskripsi dalam membantu Anda menonton film?* (How useful do you think AD is in helping you watch movies?)
- *Jika audio deskripsi tersedia secara lebih luas di Indonesia, menurut Anda, seberapa terbantu para penyandang tunanetra dalam menonton TV, film, ataupun tayangan lainnya?* (If AD are more widely available in Indonesia, how do you think it helps blind people in watching TV, movies or other shows?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda tentang audio deskripsi tersebut dalam memberi keterangan tentang siapa yang tampil di layar, siapa yang berbicara, dan tempat terjadinya adegan?* (What do you think about the AD in terms of who appears on the screen, who is speaking, and where the scene takes place?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda tentang audio deskripsi tersebut dalam memberikan detail tentang alur cerita dan karakter?* (What do you think about the AD in providing details about the storyline and characters?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda tentang kata-kata yang digunakan dalam penyampaian audio deskripsi tersebut?* (What do you think about the word choices used in delivering the AD?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda tentang tingkat kesederhanaan, kejelasan, dan keringkasan pada audio deskripsi tersebut?* (What do you think about the level of simplicity, clarity, and conciseness in the AD?)

- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda saat pertama kali mendengar audio deskripsi tersebut?* (What was your opinion when you first heard the AD?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda kepatutan kalimat dalam audio deskripsi tersebut?* (What do you think about the appropriateness of the sentences in the AD?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda terhadap gaya, nada, dan kecepatan audio deskripsi dalam film pendek tersebut?* (What do you think about the style, tone, and pace of the AD in the short film?)
- *Bagaimana pendapat Anda terhadap kenyamanan audio deskripsi tersebut saat didengar?* (How comfortable the AD is when you hear it?)
- *Menurut Anda, adakah aspek yang perlu ditingkatkan dalam audio deskripsi ini? Jika ada, silahkan disebutkan beserta solusinya.* (In your opinion, are there any aspects that need to be improved in this AD? If so, please state the solution.)
- *Seberapa puas Anda terhadap informasi serta pembawaan dalam audio deskripsi ini?* (How satisfied are you with the information and presentation in this AD?)

The results of the interviews were then transcribed and translated into English. To analyze the data, the researchers employed thematic analysis. Braun and Clarke (2006, p. 6) explained that “thematic analysis is a method for identifying, analyzing, and reporting patterns (themes) within data.” Thematic analysis was chosen as it concentrates on extracting the meaning of individual thoughts, opinions, knowledge, experiences, or values from a collection of qualitative data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). In addition, thematic analysis is the most often used data analysis method to analyze interviews (Jugder, 2016). Braun and Clarke (2006) mentioned that the researchers must generate codes and themes before doing the final step—producing the report. The researchers generated the codes using semantic coding methods or taking the codes explicitly from participants’ utterances. Then, the codes were grouped together to form the themes.

D. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The analysis aimed to investigate the perceptions of the Indonesian blind and visually impaired on the use of AD. This section elaborates the findings acquired from the interviews of eight students in *Mardi Wuto* English Club (MWEC) after watching the short film without and with AD. In a nutshell, the informants reported a positive perception of the use of AD. The positive perception can be attributed to three broad themes which are elaborated in the following subsections.

1. Perceived usefulness of the AD in comprehending scenes without dialogues

The primary function of AD is to assist blind and visually impaired audiences to understand what is happening when there is a silent scene, or when there is no dialogue in the scene yet there is an action performed by the actor(s). During these scenes, the blind and visually impaired will not get any information due to their visual impairment, and thus, they might not comprehend the storyline. In other words, the essence of an AD is that it must be able to depict the silent scenes and scenes with no dialogue to the blind and visually impaired audiences vividly.

In this research, the interviewees were asked about their opinion towards the AD assisting them to understand scenes with no dialogues in *The Rose – A Child Abuse Short Film*. There are many scenes without any dialogue in the short film; instead, only minimal sound effects (e.g., sound of crying, slap, and so on) and background music are provided to enrich the

nuance of the story. Table 2 below summarizes such scenes in the short film along with the AD corresponding to and describing those scenes.

Table 2. Depiction of Scenes without Dialogues and the Corresponding AD

Timestamp	Visual Scenes	Corresponding AD
00:00 – 00:07	(1) A female teacher holding a ruler is looming over two boys. (2) Text “CHILDLINE presents THE ROSE” appears next to the picture of the teacher and two children.	“With a ruler in hand, a teacher is standing angrily with two boys. One boy has a rose in his hand.” “CHILDLINE presents THE ROSE.”
00:10 – 00:15	(1) One of the boy, Mani, is depicted crying. (2) Mani then opens his book and shows it to the teacher.	“In the classroom, Mani is sad and crying, showing his book to the teacher”
00:16 – 00:25	(1) The teacher pulls Mani’s ear and Mani cries in pain. (2) The teacher puts her hands on Mani shoulders and shakes his body. Mani looks dizzy because of the shaking. (3) Mani performs squats as the punishment.	“The teacher pinches his ear and punishes him.” “Mani is doing sit-ups in front of her
00:26 – 00:32	(1) A boy throws a paper plane at Mani. (2) The scene changes. (3) Another boy throws a paper ball at Mani	“A boy sitting behind Mani throws a paper plane at him.” “Another boy throws a paper ball at him.”
00:33 – 00:35	(1) Mani shows his palm. (2) The teacher hits Mani’s palm with a long ruler.	“The teacher hits Mani’s palm with a ruler.”
00:40 – 00:42	(1) Mani’s seatmate gives him a toffee. (2) Mani returns the toffee to his seatmate.	“Mani’s friend offers him a toffee which he refuses.”
01:01 – 01:02	(1) Mani shows tired expression. (2) The scene changes. (3) Mani sits in the school bus.	“Now in the school bus”
01:37 – 01:40	(1) Mani’s seatmate eats the toffee he previously offered to Mani. (2) Mani’s seatmate look outside the window of the school bus. (3) The shot focuses on an advertisement board with the text “CHILD LINE 1098.”	“Mani’s friend notices an advertisement of CHILDLINE”
01:44 – 01:50	(1) Mani has a plant bud in his hand and he plants the bud in pot. (2) Mani then waters the plant. From outside the window, his friends can be seen playing together.	“At home, Mani plants a rose in a pot near the window and waters it.” “His friends are playing outside.”
01:54 – 02:01	(1) Mani ignores his friends’ invitation to play. (2) Mani sits beside the plant pot. (3) Mani yawns and falls asleep beside the pot.	“Mani sits beside the pot day and night.”

	(4) Morning comes. Mani yawns and brushes his eyes.	
02:02 – 02:04	(1) The plant bud in the plot looks fresh. (2) Mani adds mud into the pot.	“He adds mud into the pot.”
02:05 – 02:18	(1) Days change. (2) Mani touches the petals of the rose plant growing in the pot. (3) Flashback to the previous scenes in which Mani is punished is shown. (4) Mani grabs the pot and shakes it. (5) Mani shouts angrily at the plant while holding a ruler in his hand.	“After a few days, Mani touches the petals of the rose plant and suddenly thinks about his teacher’s punishment.” “He becomes tense and starts shaking the pot.” “With a ruler in his hand, he shouted at the plant.”
02:25 – 02:30	(1) Mani swings the ruler and hits the rose plant. (2) The petals of the rose fall down. (3) Mani cries.	“He hits the rose with the ruler and the petals of the rose fall down on the floor.”
02:32 – 02:34	(1) The scene changes to the classroom. (2) The teacher walks around to check the students’ rose plants while the students show their pots of roses.	“In the class, the teacher checks the rose plant.”
03:10 – 03:12	(1) A female CHILDLINE officer comes to the classroom. (2) The teacher looks unhappy.	“The CHILDLINE <i>Didi</i> talks to the teacher.”
04:09 – 04:10	(1) Mani looks sadly at his withered rose in the pot. (2) Mani’s seatmate approaches him and drags him to go and play. (3) Mani followed his seatmate with a smile on his face.	“Mani is playing happily.”
04:17 – 04:24	(1) Mani turns around when he feels someone touches his shoulder from behind. (2) Mani looks frightened as he sees the teacher looming over him. (3) Mani raises one of his hand towards the teacher with frightened expression. (4) Mani realizes that the teacher puts a toffee on his hand. (5) The teacher smiles.	“As the teacher comes there, he gets scared and lifts his hand towards her for punishment.” “But then, she gives him a toffee instead.”
04:35 – 05:08 (without AD) / 04:35 – 05:20 (with AD)	(1) The teacher hugs Mani. (2) The text “The Right of children to free and compulsory education Act 2009 (Article 17) bans all forms of physical and mental punishment and harassment” appears on the screen. (3) The text “A school that allows corporal punishment will lose its recognition. Staff involved may also face punishment” appears on the screen. (4) The texts “CHILDLINE 1098 is a national, emergency, 24X7, phone outreach service for children in need of	“The teacher hugs Mani.” “The Right of children to free and compulsory education Act 2009 (Article 17) bans all forms of physical and mental punishment and harassment.” “A school that allows corporal punishment will lose its recognition. Staff involved may also face punishment.” “CHILDLINE 1098 is a national, emergency, 24X7, phone outreach service

Patricia Nanda Setiawan, Suwarni Wijaya Halim
Analyzing the Perception of the Blind and Visually Impaired on the Use of Audio
Description: A Case Study

	care and protection. Call 1098 if you see a child in distress” appears on the screen. (5) An animation of a boy running towards the telephone booth and picking up the receiver appears on the screen. (6) The logo of CHILDLINE appears along with the texts “CHILDLINE 1098. Night & Day. www.childlineindia.org.” (7) The texts “Film supported by Government of Karnataka. Department of Women and Child Development” along with the logos of both organizations appear on the screen.	for children in need of care and protection.” “Call 1098 if you see a child in distress.” “A small boy runs towards the telephone booth and picks up the receiver.” “CHILDLINE 1098. Night and day. www.childlineindia.org” “This film is supported by the Department of Women and Child Development, Government of Karnataka.”
--	--	--

Having experienced watching the short movie without and with AD, one of the interviewees—Rick—stated that the AD was:

“Very useful, obviously. Because sometimes the film has scenes without dialogue. Although there is music, we do not understand what the actor is doing, right? We may be able to guess, but not necessarily 100% correct. So, [the AD] really describes the scene. We can clearly understand, ‘oh he is doing this,’ ‘he is doing that,’ then maybe how is the setting, what is the color, and so on.” (Rick)

The above excerpt illustrated Rick’s experience when he encountered scenes without dialogue in the short film without using the AD. He highlighted that he heard music playing during those scenes, but he was unable to decipher what was happening in those scenes just from the music. To fill the information gap, Rick tended to make guesses when the scenes without dialogue occurred. Nevertheless, he admitted that his guesses were very likely to miss the mark, although there were some clues, such as the background music and so on. With AD, he could have a clear depiction of what the characters were doing. Another interviewee—Hans—provided examples of scenes that are clarified with the help of AD:

“...I can have an idea of the actions performed by the actors in the film. For example, as described earlier, a teacher holding a ruler to hit a child, this is not in the dialogue, and earlier there was a child who watered the plants, then raised the plants, he was waiting for the plants, that’s also not in the dialogue. Now, with this audio description, as the audience, the plot becomes clearer and I can follow the storyline well.” (Hans)

From Hans’s statement, he came to understand the plot and was able to follow the storyline of the short film better after discovering the actions that occurred during the scenes without any dialogue through the AD. Some examples are the scene of the teacher holding a ruler to hit a child, which occurred between the timestamp 00:00–00:07 and the scene of a child growing a plant and taking care of it, which occurred between the timestamp 01:44–02:12. Another participant—Ary—also stated that the AD really helps him in comprehending what was happening during the scenes without dialogues in the short film. His excerpt can be seen below.

“[The AD is] Very useful, for example, perhaps in the middle of a story. So, I think it was useful because when there was no description in the middle, there was a scene in which the main character sounds sad and then angry, but I didn’t know what he was doing. Now, after the description, I came to know that he was hitting the flower with a ruler.” (Ary)

From the excerpt, it could be seen that when Ary was exposed to the short film without the AD, he was confused as to what occurred during the scenes without dialogue. As the scene depicted crucial information to the overall plot, this affected his understanding of the storyline. However, with the assistance of AD, he finally could discover what the scenes were about and fill the gap of information.

To summarize this sub-section, the majority of participants found that the AD in the short film was able to help them understand the scenes without dialogues. When they had not been exposed to AD, they tended to guess the action in those scenes. However, once they were exposed to AD, they said that they could figure out what was happening in the scenes. This statement can be proven by the participants’ better understanding of the storyline of the short film. Hans, for example, finally figured out that there was a scene of a teacher hitting her student using a ruler, whereas before listening to the short film with AD, he did not realize that such a scene occurred. Therefore, it can be concluded that the participants in this study had a positive perception of the use of AD in providing details during the scenes without dialogues, as the presence of AD was able to assist the participants in discovering the actions which occur during the scenes without dialogues.

2. Perceived usefulness of the AD in comprehending intrinsic elements of the film

Literary works such as short films are a way to communicate or convey meaning, whether through real or fictional events. Short films can be used for entertainment and also to increase knowledge, or for various other purposes. Regardless of their condition, anyone can enjoy and benefit from short films as they contain intrinsic elements that play an important role in making the plot more vivid and rich (Simaibang, 2017). For the blind and visually impaired, these intrinsic elements must be presented more specifically so that they can grasp these elements vividly. Therefore, audio description must fulfill this responsibility as it is a key accessibility feature that is made for the blind and visually impaired to watch audiovisual works.

In this research, the interviewees were asked about their understanding of the intrinsic elements, such as characters, setting, storyline, and moral values, when consuming the short film without and with AD. For instance, when Vince was asked about the setting and storyline of the short film before using the AD, he made a guess by connecting clues he got from the sounds in the film. He answered as follows:

“From the background sound, maybe... Because I heard the word ‘teacher’, I would assume that they were at school. The time of event was in the morning because I think there were flowers. In the morning, the flowers were probably fresher. The plot was probably about playing since I heard some students were inviting the others to join them play, maybe in a garden with a lot of flowers. Then perhaps, the teacher got angry at

the students because they played too much. Since I heard the high tone of the teacher's voice." (Vince)

As seen above, Vince managed to guess some of the details correctly even without the AD. However, he did not get the storyline correctly, which affected his understanding of the moral values of the film as explained below:

"From my understanding, I think the moral message is about taking care of the flowers. I heard children playing in the garden and also children plucking flowers. So maybe the message is more about taking care of the environment." (Vince)

After being interviewed, Vince was asked to watch the film once again with AD. Then the same interview questions were asked. This time, Vince were able to confidently and correctly answer all the questions regarding the intrinsic elements. Below is his response.

"The location was at school, then on a bus, and also at home since he planted the flower at home. When the setting was at school, it was morning. Then it was midday when he was on the bus, and it was late afternoon when he was at home. [The storyline is about] two students and one teacher. One of the students was crying because he was scolded by the teacher. Then the teacher gave an assignment to the students to plant a rose and warned that there would be punishment for those who did not do it. The other students on the bus planned to cheat, but Mani decided to plant the rose himself." (Vince)

After watching the film with AD, Vince was able to grasp more accurate details of the story. He was able to better identify the intrinsic elements based on the information from the AD. As a result, he was able to properly comprehend and explain the moral values behind the short film. The excerpt is as follows:

"The moral value is that punishment may affect the children's mental health. The conclusion is to avoid being too harsh in giving punishment since it could impact the growing child's mind. Don't abuse children. It is better to properly and compassionately educate the child. The analogy is the flowers. Flowers will bloom beautifully if properly tended. It is the same with children." (Vince)

Unlike Vince, other participants—Zoe, Tifa, and Kayla—managed to make better guesses than Vince after watching the film without the AD. They managed to conclude some of the locations and the time of the event in the short film, along with the storyline and the moral values. When asked about whether there are differences between watching the film without and with AD, Zoe stated as follows:

"The difference is not so significant, but I feel that I can envision the scenes clearer. Without the AD, I could understand the occurrences, but with the AD, it's like getting lights after walking on a very dark road." (Zoe)

However, Kayla stated that the AD was not really influential in assisting her in comprehending the story. Kayla is adventitiously blind, which means that she previously was

a sighted person and she gradually lost her sight after years of vision (Turner, 2005). She believed that AD did not provide significant help by stating the following:

“Maybe because I was a sighted person, I used to watch [film] without audio description, and I can enjoy it too. But, even without an audio description, I can appreciate the film with my own imagination. Even though by using audio description we can really appreciate the film more, it really depends on ourselves whether we could enjoy the film or not.” (Kayla)

Sardegna et al. (2002) reported that people who are adventitiously blind might probably remember some visual details and picture a scene in a film. Therefore, they are more skillful in terms of visualizing scenes in their mind compared to people who are congenitally blind or blind from birth. In Kayla’s case, she felt that being previously sighted gave her the ability to visualize the scenes in the short film even without assistance from the AD. Therefore, she did not feel that the AD significantly assisted her in the process of comprehending the intrinsic elements of the short film.

To conclude this sub-section, nearly all of the participants agreed that AD in the short film was able to help them grasp the story better. They tended to miss some critical details regarding the intrinsic elements of the short film when they were not assisted by AD. However, when they had the assistance from AD, they said they could map the plot into a coherent and comprehensible storyline. This assertion is supported by the participants’ comprehension of the intrinsic elements of the short film after being exposed to AD. Hans, for example, finally realized that there was a transition of some scenes. After watching the short film without AD, he could not detect those scenes; thus, he did not quite comprehend the plot’s progression. However, with the assistance of the AD, he managed to identify the changes of time and locations in the short film and was able to comprehend the plot progression better. Therefore, it can be summed up that most participants have a positive perception regarding the presence of AD in assisting them to understand the intrinsic elements of the film. Most of them claimed that the utilization of AD was able to make them comprehend and follow the film plot better.

3. Better immersion and appreciation of the film

Bilandzic and Busselle (2011) highlighted that people consume media, including watching films, for the purpose of seeking enjoyment. Films can transport the viewers to another reality, and the viewers can make and perceive meanings of the films by connecting the films with their various aspects of life (Hättich & Schweizer, 2020). However, as many films put heavy emphasis on the visual features, people who are blind and visually impaired face disadvantages. Subtle changes of pace, plot, facial expressions, and many others are often reflected in and conveyed through visual means, which is inaccessible to the blind and visually impaired. This results in the inability of the blind and visually impaired to engage with the story in the films and to immerse themselves in the different reality created by the films.

With the use of AD, however, the blind and visually impaired audience would have a chance to understand the film better; hence, becoming more immersed and invested emotionally in the story. One of the participants—Bora—stated that:

“[The AD is] Very useful since it helps me understand the story and helps me confirm the topic of the film. We watch films for enjoyment, and films are created to entertain, so if we understand the story, we will enjoy the film and will feel entertained.” (Bora)

Through her statement above, Bora acknowledged that the enjoyment of watching films is tied to one’s understanding of the story. Therefore, for the blind and visually impaired, AD helps in making the story clearer, which in turn leads to the enjoyment of the viewers who are blind and visually impaired. The same sentiment is also echoed by Ary as follows:

“The film becomes more touching. Maybe because action after action is more described, so I really feel what the main character feels.” (Ary)

The statement from Ary shows that the use of AD can enrich the experiences of the blind and visually impaired in consuming and enjoying films by providing vivid descriptions of the silent scenes which are traditionally expressed through visual means. The AD contributes to Ary’s narrative understanding, and through that understanding, Ary became more emotionally immersed in the story. Another participant—Tifa—also provides her insights:

“Without the AD, of course there are many things that I don’t know. Without the AD, I would feel confused every time there are silent scenes. What is going on? What is happening? I kept on guessing. Then the dialogues occurred, and I got new information, so I went back to analyzing the story to figure out what happened in the previous scenes. It is more about guessing without the AD. But, with the AD, I could enjoy the film and the plot more.” (Tifa)

Tifa described that when watching the film without the AD, she exerted a lot of effort to guess and analyze the plot of the story by connecting any pieces of information she acquired during the voiced portions of the film. From her statement, it could be implied that she could not properly savor and enjoy the film because she needed to constantly make guesses and piece the clues together to form a general understanding of the narrative. Nevertheless, after watching the film with AD, she reported a higher level of enjoyment in consuming the short film since the details of the short film had been provided by the AD.

In a nutshell, all participants reported that the AD greatly contributes to the participants’ enjoyment and appreciation of the film. When consuming the film without the AD, the participants spent great effort in guessing the details of the film in order to comprehend the storyline. Since their focus was on deciphering the details through non-visual cues, their enjoyment and appreciation of the film were compromised in exchange. As a result, they could not fully immerse into the film. With AD, on the other hand, they did not have to exert so much effort in interpreting the clues and guessing the details since the details had been provided for them. As a result, they could focus more on enjoying the short film, and their experience in consuming the film was greatly amplified.

The use of AD in amplifying the experiences of the blind and visually impaired in consuming audiovisual materials is in accordance with the findings of Andersen et al. (1984, cited in Zengin Temirbek uulu et al., 2021), who concluded that when assistive language such as AD was available, the blind and visually-impaired audiences would obtain a greater and more enjoyable experience when consuming audiovisual materials. In addition, the finding is

in line with the research by Ferziger et al. (2020), who claimed that AD boosts the satisfaction and quality of the blind and visually-impaired audience's theatrical performance experience.

E. CONCLUSION

The present study investigates the perception of the blind and visually impaired on the use of AD. The findings show that most research participants of this study have a positive perception of the use of AD in the short film "The Rose" since the AD provides assistance in deciphering scenes without dialogues, comprehending the intrinsic elements of the film, and immersing the participants in the story. Only a few participants stated that the aid provided by the AD was not immensely significant, yet they admitted that they preferred having the AD when consuming audiovisual materials. This shows that the AD could be a tool to assist the blind and visually impaired, and thus, its existence should be facilitated more widely in Indonesia so that the blind and visually impaired in Indonesia could access audiovisual materials more conveniently and frequently. As for the implications of the study, it is hoped that more people will be more aware of the existence and the benefits of AD, and researchers could advocate for wider application of AD in various audiovisual materials accessible in Indonesia.

REFERENCES

- Bardini, F. (2017). Audio Description Style and the Film Experience of Blind Spectators: Design of a Reception Study. *Rivista Internazionale Di Tecnica Della Traduzione / International Journal of Translation*, 19, 49–73. <https://doi.org/10.13137/2421-6763/17351>
- Benecke, B. (2007). Audio description: Phenomena of information sequencing. *EU-High-Level Scientific Conference Series MuTra 2007 LSP Translation Scenarios: Conference Proceedings*.
- Bilandzic, H., & Busselle, R. W. (2011). Enjoyment of films as a function of narrative experience , perceived realism and transportability. *Communications*, 36, 29–50. <https://doi.org/10.1515/COMM.2011.002>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Applied Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-35913-1>
- Chao, Y. (2002). *Images Flowing in the World of Language: To Construct a Theoretical Framework for Audio Description*. Wunan Publishing Co.
- Chiaro, D. (2012). Audiovisual Translation. In *The Encyclopedia of Applied Linguistics*. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405198431.wbeal0061>
- CHILDLINEIndia. (2013). The Rose - A Child Abuse Short Film by CHILDLINE 1098. Posted March 22nd, 2013, by CHILDLINEIndia. Youtube. 5:10. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nmCEg46M05U>.
- CHILDLINEIndia. (2015). The Rose - A Child Abuse Short Film with Audio Description | CHILDLINE 1098. Posted February 14th, 2015, by CHILDLINEIndia. Youtube. 5:21. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aZXw5zS6ttg>.

- Crowe, S., Cresswell, K., Robertson, A., Huby, G., Avery, A., & Sheikh, A. (2011). The case study approach. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 11(1), 100–108. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2288-11-100>
- Díaz-Cintas, J. (2008). *The didactics of audiovisual translation*. John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Engliana, E., & da Silva, A. M. (2025). Peran pendidik dalam AI, kecerdasan digital, dan berpikir kritis. In C. R. P. Ajisuksmo, M. D. Tengangatu, & L. A. Manggala Y. (Eds.), *Perkembangan informasi dan teknologi digital bagi kehidupan manusia kini dan akan datang* (pp. 335-372). Penerbit Universitas Katolik Indonesia Atma Jaya.
- Ferziger, N., Dror, Y. F., Gruber, L., Nahari, S., Goren, N., Neustadt-Noy, N., Katz, N., & Erez, A. B. H. (2020). Audio description in the theater: Assessment of satisfaction and quality of the experience among individuals with visual impairment. *British Journal of Visual Impairment*, 38(3), 299–311. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0264619620912792>
- Hättich, A., & Schweizer, M. (2020). I hear what you see: Effects of audio description used in a cinema on immersion and enjoyment in blind and visually impaired people. *British Journal of Visual Impairment*, 38(3), 284–298. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0264619620911429>
- Hyks, V. (2005). Audio Description and Translation. Two related but different skills. *Translating Today*, 4(July), 6–8.
- Jakobson, R. (1959). *On linguistic aspects of translation*. Routledge.
- Jankowska, A. (2019). Training future describers : A practice report from an audio description classroom. *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series: Themes in Translation Studies*, 18, 197–215. <https://doi.org/10.52034/lanstts.v18i0.517>.
- Jugder, N. (2016). The thematic analysis of interview data: An approach used to examine the influence of the market on curricular provision in Mongolian higher education institutions. *Hillary Place Papers*. <https://doi.org/10.48785/100/229>.
- Karolina, C. M., Maryani, E., & Sjuchro, D. W. (2019). Model komunikasi Ideal antara Tuna Netra dan Visual Reader dalam Menonton Film Eni Maryani. *Jurnal Komunikasi*, 14(1), 61–74. <https://doi.org/10.20885/komunikasi.vol14.iss1.art4>
- Kumar, R. (2019). *Research methodology: A step-by-step guide for beginners*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Lopez, M. J., Cyril, G., & Hofstadter, K. (2018). Audio Description in the UK: What works, what doesn't and understanding the need for personalising access. *British Journal of Visual Impairment*, 36(3), 274–291. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0264619618794750>
- Perego, E. (2019). Into the language of museum audio descriptions: A corpus-based study. *Perspectives*, 27(3), 333–349. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2018.1544648>
- Remael, A., Reviere, N., & Vercauteren, G. (2015). *Pictures painted in words: Adlab Audio Description guidelines*. EUT Edizioni Università di Trieste.
- Rif'Ati, L., Halim, A., Lestari, Y. D., Moeloek, N. F., & Limburg, H. (2021). Blindness and visual impairment situation in Indonesia based on rapid assessment of avoidable blindness surveys in 15 provinces. *Ophthalmic epidemiology*, 28(5), 408-419.

- <https://doi.org/10.1080/09286586.2020.1853178>
- Sardegna, J., McGovern, S. S., Rutzen, A. R., & Steidl, S. M. (2002). *The encyclopedia of blindness and vision impairment*. Facts On File, Inc.
- Simaibang, B. (2017). *English language teaching in a foreign situation*. Citra Books.
- Taufik, A. (2017). Making the Standard of Audiovisual Text for the Deaf and Hearing Impaired. *Journal of English Language and Culture*, 7(1), 1-6. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30813/jelc.v7i1.1017>.
- Taufik, A. (2022). Devising a Marking Criteria for the Assessment of Audiovisual Translation Products in an Academic Context. *Journal of English Language and Culture*, 12(2), 72–83. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30813/jelc.v12i2.3237>.
- Taufik, A., & Tan, T. (2018). Evaluating Automated Speech Recognition Captioning and its Possibilities of Language Learning. *JETAFL (Journal of English Teaching as a Foreign Language)*, 4(1), 68–82.
- Turner, F. J. (2005). *Canadian Encyclopedia of social work*. Wilfrid Laurier University Press.
- Udo, J., & Fels, D. I. (2010). Universal design on stage: Live audio description for theatrical performances. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 18(3), 189_203. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2010.485683>
- Zengin Temirbek uulu, Z., Sağın-Şimşek, Ç., & Antonova-Ünlü, E. (2021). The effect of audio description on film comprehension of individuals with visual impairment : A case study in Turkey. *British Journal of Visual Impairment*, 41(1), 130–142. <https://doi.org/10.1177/02646196211020058>